

City of Apache Junction





PLANNING AND ZONING COMMISSION PUBLIC HEARING STAFF REPORT

DATE:

September 11, 2018

CASE NUMBERS:

GPA-1-18 & PZ-2-18

OWNERS/APPLICANTS:

Amerco Real Estate Company and U-Haul

International LLC

REPRESENTATIVE:

David Pollock

REQUEST:

GPA-1-18 proposes to redesignate approximately 50 acres of a 78-acre property from Community Commercial to

Light Industrial/Business Park.

PZ-2-18 is the companion rezoning to the GPA, proposing to rezone the $\pm 1/-50$ acres from B-1/PD (General Commercial by Planned Development) to B-5/PD (Light Industrial/ Business Park by Planned Development) for the purpose of developing part of the property with a U-Haul Moving and Storage Facility and conceptually planning the rest of the property for multiple light

industrial businesses.

LOCATION:

The property is located at the southeast corner area of US60 and S. Idaho Road.

GENERAL PLAN/

ZONING DESIGNATION:

Community Commercial opportunity area; currently conceptually zoned for a retail

power center by planned development.

SURROUNDING USES:

North: US60:

South: Vacant state land and city Public Works facility (zoned RS-GR and

PI, respectively);

Baseline Industrial Park (zoned East:

B-5);

West: Vacant state land (zoned RS-20).

BACKGROUND

The 78-acre subject property was rezoned from CI-1/PD (Light Industry and Warehouse Zone by Planned Development) to C-3/PD (General Commercial by Planned Development) back in 2007. The developers at that time planned to develop the property with a retail power center with big box stores, shops and pads for other tenants, totaling over 600,000 square feet of retail and commercial opportunity space. The economic recession which hit in 2008 basically put an end to all of those plans and the property owners eventually sold the property to Amerco around 2011. Staff has been conversing with U-Haul and Amerco (U-Haul's real estate company) representatives since early 2012 about repurposing the property for something else, since U-Haul did not want to develop an 80-acre retail center and the city was not too keen on an 80-acre U-Haul facility.

The city's 2014 adoption of a new zoning ordinance and maps renamed the zoning district of the property to B-1/PD, but the provisions of Ordinance No. 1313 are still in effect (see Ord. #1313 and concept plans attached).

PROPOSALS

GPA-1-18 is a proposed land use plan map amendment to the city's general plan, to redesignate approximately 50 acres of the 78-acre property from Community Commercial to Light Industrial/Business Park. U-Haul proposes to construct a moving and storage facility at the northwest corner of the property (immediate southeast corner of US60 and Idaho) on about 10 acres, and the east half of the overall property (40 acres) would be reserved and conceptually planned for multiple, light industrial businesses. The remaining 28 acres just south of the U-Haul lot on the west half of the overall property would remain designated a Community Commercial opportunity area.

PZ-2-18 is the companion rezoning request for the proposed 50-acre industrial property described above, proposing to rezone said 50 acres from B-1/PD (General Commercial by Planned Development) to B-5/PD (Light Industrial/Business Park by Planned Development). The remaining 28 acres of the property south of the proposed U-Haul lot would still be zoned B-1/PD, and could still accommodate some type of shopping and/or retail center under the general conditions and intent of Ordinance No. 1313. The companion rezoning is being processed concurrently

at risk. If the general plan amendment request is ultimately not approved, then the rezoning request must also be denied.

See Amerco/U-Haul's narrative and conceptual drawing exhibits for both the general plan amendment and rezoning requests attached.

PLANNING STAFF ANALYSIS AND FINDINGS

Relationship to General Plan:

The subject site is designated by the city's General Plan as a "Community Commercial" opportunity area, which normally accommodates B-1, B-2 or B-3 zoned properties. General warehouse and storage, mini-storage and outside storage yard uses typically require industrial zoning. They are not simply allowed outright in the less intense commercial zones.

The general plan amendment is required because the applicants wish to rezone more than 10 acres of property for industrial uses. In early discussions, U-Haul had proposed more than 10 acres for their facility. Through discussions which also included Economic Development staff, we compromised on the idea of keeping a good portion of the property for retail and shopping opportunities to benefit future mixed use development to the south of Baseline, and by limiting the potential industrial uses to lighter intensity. State land property on the west side of Idaho is currently designated community commercial, but is currently zoned single-family residential for 2-acre lots. State land property to the south of Baseline is designated master planned community, but is currently zoned general rural, 1.25-acre lots. Both of those designations and zonings will surely change in the future.

Zoning/Site Context:

The site has ideal access and visibility from the freeway on its north side. Idaho Road on the west and Baseline Avenue on the south are considered major thoroughfares, but currently lack even complete half-street improvements. Winchester Road on the property's east side is also currently developed as a half-street, constructed by the developers of Baseline Industrial Park.

In their GPA and rezoning narratives, the applicants state that the adjacent streets are adequate to support the anticipated industrial development. In their proposed rezoning conditions, they offer to provide street improvements only to serve the

initial 10-acre facility and defer additional street improvements to future developers. Among the conditions of approval, staff will recommend that the applicants provide street improvements as determined by the city engineer as part of first phase development, which may go well beyond just the northwest 10-acre portion of the property. Lot by lot, segment by segment, piecemeal street improvements are not a good idea. The planned development rezoning is the opportunity for the city to gain the infrastructure that it needs to support future industrial and retail development, especially as part of a platted subdivision which will most likely follow in the near future. As an example, the developers of Baseline Industrial Park constructed all of the necessary streets and infrastructure. That is what made their lots attractive to future buyers. Individual lot developers then provided on-site improvements, with most of the off-sites already provided, which made those lots truly shovel-ready.

Planned Development Zoning:

The proposed B-5/PD zoning will facilitate uses conducive to creating a clean industry employment area. See the suggested list of uses for the B-1/PD and B-5/PD portions of the property. With proper land use controls such as design guidelines, landscaping, screening and setback buffers, and by limiting the palette of uses on the site under the planned development zoning, a compatible commercial and industrial development site can be reasonably integrated at this location, next to anticipated mixed use and residential developments to the west and south in the future. Straight ahead B-5 zoning could have allowed many undesirable uses. Staff worked with the applicants to craft a palette of uses that weeds out some of the more obnoxious uses, better suited and compatible to light industrial development. The only thing we really disagreed on was U-Haul also wanting to include RV storage at their facility. narrative talks about offering about 200 RV storage spaces. Their conceptual site plan shows around 159 covered RV storage spaces and maybe some uncovered spaces. The conceptual plan also shows approximately 122 storage units in various buildings with exterior access and possibly hundreds of mini-storage units inside the building. To be fair and consistent, Staff will continue to recommend against more RV storage lots in the city.

For the most part, U-Haul agrees to the city's standard zoning and improvement requirements. They are asking for some deviations relative to signage and building heights, which staff will address in the recommended conditions at the public hearing on

August 28 and September 11. As always, if other deviations from standard requirements or different uses are proposed at the time of development, then a future developer will need to process another PD amendment for their specific development plan.

Infrastructure Improvements:

The developers of the property will need to extend all necessary services to the site. Sewer and Apache Junction Water District facilities are apparently already nearby. SRP has two substations in the city ready to serve the 78-acre site. Century Link, Southwest Gas and cable communication facilities will probably also need to be extended. Surrounding streets will eventually require widening, sidewalk, curbing, gutters, streetlights, fire hydrants, drainage and other improvements. Of course, all other necessary on-site and off-site improvements, including commercial driveways, retention basins, accessible routes, etc., will also need to be provided at the time of development.

Criteria for General Plan Amendments:

As part of a general plan amendment application, the city asks an applicant to address how their proposal satisfies the criteria for a major amendment request. Amerco did a good job in addressing the criteria and much of it has been echoed by economic development staff. Although it would have been ideal to see the site develop under the 2007 conceptual plan, economic and market realities are what they are. Planning staff has no conflicts with Amerco's rationale for the major amendment and we will continue to work with them and future developers to realize a quality light industrial area for the city. Staff's own assessment of the criteria is that the proposed amendment:

- 1) Proposes a land use designation that the land use plan map does not adequately provide optional sites to accommodate;
- 2) Constitutes an overall improvement to the general plan and is not solely for the benefit of a particular land owner at a particular point in time, and is consistent with the overall intent of the 2010 General Plan;
- 3) Is justified by an error in the 2010 General Plan, in that not enough land was designated for business park/ industrial uses;
- 4) Is generally consistent with goals, objectives and other elements of the 2010 General Plan;
- 5) Is justified by a change in community conditions or neighborhood characteristics since adoption of the plan;

- 6) Will not adversely impact a portion of, or the entire community by:
 - a) significantly altering acceptable existing land use patterns, especially in established neighborhoods;
 - b) significantly reducing the housing to jobs balance in the planning area;
 - c) substantially decreasing existing and future water supplies;
 - d) replacing employment with residential uses;
 - e) requiring additional and more expensive improvements to infrastructure systems and/or proximity to municipal facilities and/or services than are needed to support the prevailing land uses and which, therefore, may impact the level of service for existing and proposed developments in other areas;
 - f) increasing traffic (without mitigation measures) on existing roadways beyond the planned level of service, and that negatively impact existing and planned land uses:
 - g) affecting the existing character (i.e., visual, physical and functional) of the immediate area;
 - h) increasing the exposure of residents to aviation generated noise, safety and/or flight operations;
 - i) materially diminishing the environmental quality of the air, water, land, or cultural resources; and
 - j) significantly altering recreational amenities such as open space, parks and trails.

Public Input:

As is required by law for general plan amendment requests, the city sent out a request for comments to numerous agencies at least 60-days prior to the advertisement of the public hearings. The due date for comments was August 13. The GPA and rezoning cases were also advertised in the appropriate newspapers and individual notices were sent to property owners within 500 feet of the property, informing them of the public hearing dates. The applicants conducted a citizen participation outreach meeting on July 26, 2018. The summary report of the meeting is attached. As of the writing of this report, we have received one comment on the GPA proposal. Mr. Steve Holland, who owns Shady RV Storage in Baseline Industrial Park and who attended the public outreach meeting, called expressing concerns about U-Haul's proposed RV storage lot. He fears that despite assurances and comments from the applicants about establishing a mutually beneficial relationship, the much better located and visible U-Haul site will eventually put him out of business.

As of the writing of this report, staff has not received any other comments from neighbors of the property, nor from any of the outside agencies to whom request for comments were sent.

DISCUSSION MEETINGS:

Staff took Amerco/U-Haul's GPA and rezoning requests to the commission for discussion on August 14 and to the city council for discussion on August 20. Commissioners and councilmembers mostly had questions about U-Haul's intent with regard to the development of the overall site, to which staff responded that U-Haul was mostly focused on the development of their lot, but that they were working with the city to allow us to be more responsive to and create opportunities for other commercial and industrial development proposals.

Commissioners also had questions about the proposed PD exclusions lists for the B-1/PD and B-5/PD parts of the property. For the commission and council's information, the complete commercial matrix from the zoning ordinance has been added to the attachments. Once again, the intent of the exclusions list is to try and create opportunities for retail, office and clean industry types of businesses, with buildings on properties, not storage yards and other incompatible or unsightly uses that can be found in other parts of the city. Baseline Industrial Park is a good example of a development which has tried hard to maintain a clean industry type of presence; whereas a couple of the county islands and other older industrial parts of the city are examples of what we are trying to avoid (open storage lots, tow lots, junk car lots, salvage and junk yards, etc.).

PUBLIC HEARING ON AUGUST 28, 2018

At the P&Z meeting on August 28, Mr. Pollock made a presentation as the applicant. He discussed Amerco's intent with regard to the development of the property--not just the U-Haul site, but all of it and showed examples of other similar developments in the Phoenix metro area. He stated that Amerco is partnering with CBRE to market the site to businesses. He said Amerco plans to be the master developer of the site and the landlord, so it is important to them to attract quality tenants. Commissioners had comments and questions about what might develop on state lands to the west and south of the site, what types of businesses Amerco was trying to attract, the fears of other business owners who are afraid a large U-Haul facility

will negatively affect their businesses; and also, about the fact that the city is not favorable towards any more RV storage lots. The city wants and needs jobs and sales tax revenue. Mr. Pollock stated that other U-Haul dealers in town should have nothing to fear and he alluded to RV storage as being incidental and not necessarily crucial to the site. There were no public comments on the case.

PLANNING DIVISION RECOMMENDATIONS

The planning division recommends approval of case GPA-1-18, to redesignate 50 acres of the 78 acre property from Community Commercial to Light Industrial/Business Park. Planning concurs with economic development staff that the city needs more viable, sizeable, shovel ready industrial land to be able to compete for regional development projects.

The planning division also recommends approval of case PZ-2-18, to amend the plan of development for the former B-1/PD power center and to rezone 50 acres of the 78 acre property from B-1/PD to B-5/PD. Staff's recommended conditions are listed below. We note that the applicant's rezoning narrative (attached) modeled several of their suggested conditions from Ordinance #1313, which approved the current zoning for the power center. Staff has also borrowed from Ordinance 1313 and from the applicant's suggested conditions, but we brought some conditions more up to date and we still recommend against RV storage on the 78 acre property. Please note that the Commission needs to make two motions, one for case GPA-1-18 and one for case PZ-2-18.

RECOMMENDED MOTION FOR GPA-1-18

I move that the Planning and Zoning Commission recommend to the Apache Junction City Council the (APPROVAL/DENIAL) of general plan amendment case GPA-1-18, a request by Amerco Real Estate Company, represented by David Pollock, to redesignate 50 acres of the 78-acre property, located at the southeast corner of US60 and S. Idaho Road, from "community commercial" to "light industrial/business park", for the purpose of facilitating a rezoning and planned development amendment for the property, to allow it to be developed with retail and light industrial uses that are more conducive and responsive to current economic and market factors.

RECOMMENDED MOTION FOR PZ-2-18

I move that the Planning and Zoning Commission recommend to the Apache Junction City Council the (APPROVAL/DENIAL) of planned development rezoning case PZ-2-18, a request by Amerco Real Estate Company, represented by David Pollock, to rezone approximately 50 acres of a 78-acre property located at the southeast corner of US60 and S. Idaho Road, from General Commercial District by Planned Development ("B-1/PD") to Light Industrial/Business Park by Planned Development ("B-5/PD"); and that the development plan for the remaining portion of the 78-acre property be amended for a smaller retail and commercial shopping center in basic compliance with the conceptual development plan submitted with case PZ-2-18; subject to the following conditions of approval:

- 1) The design of all buildings and landscape features shall be in compliance with all applicable City of Apache Junction codes and development guides including, but not limited to:
 - a. Zoning Ordinance, Article 1-4, Section 1-4-3: Planned Development (PD) Overlay District;
 - b. Zoning Ordinance, Article 1-5, Sections 1-5-3 & 1-5-4: Non-residential Use Regulations & Nonresidential Bulk Regulations;
 - c. Zoning Ordinance, Article 1-7, Parking, Loading and Circulation Regulations;
 - d. Zoning Ordinance, Article 1-8, Landscape Regulations;
 - e. Zoning Ordinance, Article 1-10, Outdoor Lighting Regulations;
 - f. Zoning Ordinance, Article 1-11, Sign Regulations;
 - g. Zoning Ordinance, Article 1-12, Flood Plain Management & Storm Water Regulations;
 - h. Zoning Ordinance, Article 1-13, Design Guidelines;
 - i. Zoning Ordinance, Article 1-14, Engineering Standards.

The above codes and development standards must be adhered to except as otherwise conditioned herein. The city's Design Guidelines for commercial buildings shall also apply to industrial buildings. No metal-sided buildings larger than 120-square feet shall be allowed, with exceptions for bay doors.

2) Applicants shall comply with the conceptual development plans as described in the project narrative and as shown on the drawings submitted with cases GPA-1-18 and PZ-2-18, except that the conceptual site plans for Retail Areas A

- and B, and Industrial Area 2 shall be more fully developed and/or proposed for subdivision at such time as development projects are proposed.
- 3) All future pads and shops in Retail Areas A and B shall be architecturally compatible within any anchor tenants.
- Upon rezoning approval, property owners shall dedicate to the city all necessary rights-of-way and cutoff corners as determined by the city engineer, including: the west 75 feet of the gross property for S. Idaho Road; the south 50 feet of the gross property for E. Baseline Avenue; the east 30 feet of the gross property for S. Winchester Road; and at minimum, a 50 foot wide right-of-way for E. 34th Avenue from Idaho Road to Winchester Road.
- 5) Street improvements along the property's adjacent and interior roadways identified in #1 above, including but not limited to, the extension of pavement, the provision of sidewalk, curb, gutter, streetlights, fire hydrants, driveways, drainage improvements, the undergrounding of utility lines, acceleration/deceleration lanes, and other improvements as determined by the city engineer, shall be constructed as part of this planned development rezoning and be subject to final approval by the city engineer.
- on the property and/or at the time that all or parts of the property are subdivided. However, all half-street improvements shall be constructed on Idaho Road from US60 to Baseline Avenue; and full width street improvements for E. 34th Avenue from Idaho Road to Winchester Road shall be constructed as part of first phase development, concurrent with the U-Haul facility. All street improvements and street frontage landscaping applicable to Industrial Area I shall be completed prior to building occupancy. Remaining street improvements and street frontage landscaping will be completed by future developers prior to building occupancy.
- 7) Retention basins shall be a maximum 4 to 1 slope when adjacent to public right-of-way or pedestrian walkways.
- Building mounted, monument, and freeway signs shall be incorporated into and/or designed to complement architectural styles of the buildings and be consistent with the sign code. For anchor tenants (100,000 square feet or more)

the maximum sign area for an exterior mounted sign shall not exceed 350 square feet. For minor tenants the maximum sign area for front elevation mounted signs shall not exceed 150 square feet; the maximum size of a sign for rear and side elevations shall not exceed 100 square feet each. All signs mounted on rear elevations facing U.S. highway 60 shall be mounted at the same height. Monument signs fronting on Idaho, Baseline, Winchester or any interior streets, shall consist of low-profile monument signs and only one double-sided monument sign, which may be a multitenant sign in the case of a shopping center or an industrial park, shall be allowed per driveway entrance. Industrial Areas 1 and 2 shall be allowed a double-sided, multi-tenant freeway sign, located on the north portions of the properties, east of Idaho Road, the final design of which shall be subject to planning staff review and approval.

- 9) Maximum building heights for main buildings shall not exceed forty feet (45') as measured from the finished floor to the peak of the roof for B-5/PD zoned areas. B-1/PD areas will adhere to the maximum height designated in Zoning Ordinance Article 1-5, Section 1-5-4: Non-Residential Bulk Regulations. Accessory buildings are limited to standard height requirements for accessory buildings.
- 10) All cart storage corrals located in the parking lots of Retail Areas A and B shall be buffered on each side with a 4 ½ foot wide landscape planter.
- 11) Applicants/developers agree to contribute to the costs of any necessary traffic signals to be installed along Idaho Road and Baseline Avenue, to be negotiated with the city engineer.
- 12) Developers of the property shall be responsible for properly applying for and obtaining all necessary permits for any off-site and on-site improvements or construction. All improvements shall be designed in compliance with city codes and standards in effect at the time. Developers shall also pay all applicable fees, including permit, plan review and development fees.

- 13) Developers shall identify on all site plans accommodations for motorcycle parking and bicycle racks.
- 14) The permitted uses in B-1/PD zoning district shall be those which are permitted by Zoning Ordinance, Article 1-5, Section 1-5-3: Non-residential Use Regulations, except that the following uses shall not be permitted herein:

```
Medical marijuana facilities;
Homeless shelter:
Tattoo and/or piercing services;
Death care services:
Cemeteries & crematories;
Commercial parking lots & garages;
Oil & gas extraction;
Contractor's office, shop and/or storage (indoor and/or
outdoor);
Bus transportation terminal;
Religious & fraternal organizations;
Payday loan or check-cashing business;
Laundromat or dry cleaning business;
General Automotive repair;
Auto Body shop;
Motorcycle repair;
Vehicle renting & leasing;
Schools:
Psvchiatric & substance abuse services;
Nursing & residential care;
Rooming & boarding houses;
Group homes;
Animal hospitals & kennels;
Social advocacy, human rights, conservation, business &
professional, labor, political organizations;
Manufactured home & RV sales:
Semi-truck service or repair;
Massage services;
Swap meet:
Manufactured home or RV parks or campgrounds;
RV, boat, or vehicle storage;
Horse boarding or riding stables;
Outdoor storage, assembly or repair businesses;
General Warehouse or mini-storage;
Taxi or shuttle businesses;
Community food & relief services;
Second-hand or used merchandise sales;
```

Use vehicle sales;
Any residential uses;
Government offices & courts;
Newspaper, periodical & book publishing;
Cleaning, landscaping & extermination services;
Crop production;
Solar farm;
Recycling & drop-off centers.

15) The permitted uses in B-5/PD zoning district shall be those which are permitted by Zoning Ordinance, Article 1-5, Section 1-5-3: Non-residential Use Regulations, except the following uses shall not be permitted herein:

Semi-truck stop; Medical marijuana facilities; Cemeteries & crematories; Commercial parking lots & garages; Oil & gas extraction; Mining; Quarrying; Animal slaughtering; Petroleum & coal products manufacturing; Chemical manufacturing; Contractor's office, shop and/or storage (indoor and/or outdoor); Truck transportation terminal; Bus transportation terminal; Tow truck parking & storage; Beef, dairy, sheep, goat & hog production; Poultry & egg production; Waste tire collection and/or storage; Adult oriented uses: Manufactured home sales: Schools, except for trade & technical schools; Public recreation facilities: Public outdoor music festivals: Social advocacy, human rights, conversation, business & professional, labor, political organizations; Horse boarding or riding stables; Government offices & courts: Water & sewerage systems/facilities; Foundries; Air transportation terminal; RV, boat, or vehicle storage; Outdoor storage yard by itself;

Outdoor storage of equipment or materials for more than 180 days incidental to established building and principal use; Recycling and drop-off centers; Crop production.

- 16) Future land divisions of the rezoned properties which result in 4 or more lots being created, shall require the owners to proceed through a subdivision process.
- 17) Any request for deviation from the city's development standards or for uses determined by the Zoning Administrator to not be conducive to creating a commercial, retail, office opportunity as described herein shall require a separate planned development amendment, rezoning, landscape code appeal or conditional use permit process first, as may be appropriate.

Prepared by Rudy Esquivias

Senior Dlanner/Zoning Administrator

Attachments:

Exhibit #1 - Current Ord. #1313 and elevation and site plan exhibits

Exhibit #2 - GPA-1-18 application

Exhibit #3 - U-Haul's GPA narrative report

Exhibit #4 - Land use map amendment, conceptual site plan and survey exhibits

Exhibit #5 - PZ-2-18 rezoning application

Exhibit #6 - Rezoning case narrative

Exhibit #7 - U-Haul's proposed rezoning conditions

Exhibit #8 - Staff's proposed PD exclusions lists dated 5-22-18

Exhibit #9 - Section 1-5-3 Non-residential Use Regulations

Exhibit #10 - Public Participation Summary Report

Exhibit #11 - U-Haul updated site plan dated July 2018